CONSTITUTIONAL PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN LATIN AMERICA

A Comparative Study of the Amparo proceeding

Allan R. Brewer-Carías

Professor of Law, Central University of Venezuela
Vice-President, International Academy of Comparative Law
Adjunct Professor of Law, Columbia Law School (2006–2007)
INTRODUCTION

PART ONE
THE CONSTITUTIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND ITS JUDICIAL GUARANTIES

Chapter One
The Constitutional Declaration of Human Rights in Latin America and Its internationalization

I. THE SCOPE OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL DECLARATION
   1. The expansion of the constitutional declaration of rights
   2. The changes in the obliged party regarding constitutional rights and freedoms
   3. The declarative nature of the constitutional declaration of rights and the open constitutional clauses
   4. The absolute or limitative character of the declaration

II. THE INTERNATIONALIZATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND ITS CONSTITUTIONALIZATION
    1. The American internationalization of human rights
    2. Theconstitutionalization of the internationalization of human rights
       A. The supraconstitutional rank of international instruments of human rights
       B. The constitutional rank of international instruments of human rights
       C. The supra-statutory rank of international treaties on human rights
       D. The statutory rank of international treaties on human rights
CONTENTS

3. The interpretative constitutional rules regarding the international instruments on human rights 54
   A. The interpretation of the Constitution according to the provisions of international instruments 54
   B. The constitutional general references to the universal declarations on human rights 55
   C. The enforcement of rights regardless of their statutory regulation 57
   D. The principle of progressive interpretation of constitutional rights 59

Chapter Two
Judicial Guaranties of the Declaration of Human Rights 62
I. THE JUDICIAL GUARANTIES OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS 65
II. THE SPECIFIC JUDICIAL MEANS FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS 73
   1. The European amparo actions 73
   2. The Latin American amparo proceeding 77
   3. The writ of amparo in the Philippines 79

PART TWO
THE AMPARO AS A LATIN AMERICAN CONSTITUTIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL LAW INSTITUTION 81

Chapter Three
Judicial Review and Amparo Proceeding in Latin America 87

Chapter Four
The Amparo Action in Countries that Apply Only the Diffuse System of Judicial Review of Legislation 92

Chapter Five
The Amparo Action in Countries that Apply Only the Concentrated Method of Judicial Review of Legislation 102
I. THE AMPARO ACTION IN CONCENTRATED SYSTEMS OF JUDICIAL REVIEW EXERCISED BEFORE ONE SINGLE COURT

1. The recourse for amparo and habeas corpus in Costa Rica
   103

2. The recourse of amparo and of habeas corpus in El Salvador
   106

II. THE AMPARO ACTION IN CONCENTRATED SYSTEMS OF JUDICIAL REVIEW EXERCISED BEFORE A VARIETY OF COURTS

1. The recourse of amparo and habeas corpus in Bolivia
   107

2. The recourse for protection and of habeas corpus in Chile
   109

3. The action of amparo and habeas corpus in Honduras
   111

4. The action of amparo and habeas corpus in Panama
   114

5. The action for amparo, habeas corpus and habeas data in Paraguay
   115

6. The action of amparo and habeas corpus in Uruguay
   117

Chapter Six
The amparo as a Constitutional Right in Countries with Mixed Systems of Judicial Review of Legislation

I. THE AMPARO ACTION IN COUNTRIES WITH MIXED SYSTEMS (DIFFUSE AND CONCENTRATED) OF JUDICIAL REVIEW

II. THE MEXICAN SUIT OF AMPARO

III. THE RIGHT TO AMPARO IN VENEZUELA

Chapter Seven
The Amparo as a Constitutional Guaranty in Countries With Mixed Systems of Judicial Review of Legislation

I. THE AMPARO AS AN EXCLUSIVE COMPETENCE OF ONE SINGLE TRIBUNAL

II. THE ACTION FOR AMPARO EXERCISE BEFORE A VARIETY OF COURTS

1. Mandado de segurança, mandado de injunção, habeas corpus and habeas data in Brazil
   142

2. The action for tutela and habeas corpus in Colombia
   147
3. The action of amparo and habeas corpus in the Dominican Republic  151
4. The action of amparo, habeas corpus and habeas data in Ecuador  153
5. The amparo in Guatemala  155
6. The recourse of amparo, habeas corpus and habeas data in Peru  159

Chapter Eight
The American Convention on Human Rights and the internationalization of the Amparo in Latin America  163

I. THE INTERNATIONALIZATION OF THE AMPARO PROCEEDING  163
II. THE AMPARO IN THE AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS  164
III. THE FEATURES OF THE AMPARO AS A RIGHT AND AS JUDICIAL GUARANTY  168
   1. The amparo as a human right  168
   2. The amparo as a judicial guaranty  169
   3. The amparo as a simple, prompt and effective judicial guaranty  170
IV. THE RIGHTS TO BE PROTECTED BY THE AMERICAN CONVENTION AMPARO  171
   1. The amparo as a judicial guaranty for the protection of everyone’s rights and guaranties  171
   2. The amparo as a judicial guaranty for the protection of all constitutional rights and guaranties  173
V. THE UNIVERSAL CHARACTER OF THE PROTECTION IN THE AMERICAN CONVENTION AMPARO  174
   1. The amparo as a judicial guaranty for the protection of all constitutional rights and guaranties, against any violation or harm from the State or individuals  174
   2. The amparo as a judicial guaranty that can be filed at any time, including in situations of emergency  176
PART THREE
THE INJURED PARTY AND THE CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS PROTECTED BY MEANS OF THE AMPARO PROCEEDING

Chapter Nine
The Injured Party: The Plaintiff and the Rules of Standing

I. THE INJURED PERSONS AND THE QUESTION OF STANDING
   1. Natural persons: Standing ad causam and ad processum
   2. Artificial persons: Standing ad causam and ad processum
   3. Standing and the protection of collective and diffuse constitutional rights

II. PUBLIC OFFICIALS WITH STANDING IN THE AMPARO PROCEEDING
   1. The People’s Defendant’s standing to file amparo actions
   2. The question of the standing of other public officers in the amparo suit

III. THE INJURED THIRD PARTY FOR THE PLAINTIFF

Chapter Ten
The Justiciable Constitutional Rights by Means of the Amparo and Habeas Corpus Actions

I. CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS AND JUSTICIABILITY

II. AMPARO FOR THE JUSTICIABILITY OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS ONLY IN CASES OF CONSTITUTIONAL VIOLATIONS

III. AMPARO AND HABEAS CORPUS FOR THE PROTECTION OF ALL CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS

IV. AMPARO AND HABEAS CORPUS FOR THE PROTECTION OF ONLY SOME CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS
   1. The European restrictive scope of the amparo
   2. The Chilean acción de protección for determined rights
CONTENTS

3. The Colombian acción de tutela for the protection of fundamental rights 228

4. The Mexican amparo for the protection of the “individual guarantees” 231

5. The writ of amparo in the Philippines for the protection of the right to life, liberty and safety 233

V. THE QUESTION OF THE PROTECTION OF RIGHTS IN SITUATIONS OF EMERGENCY 234

Chapter Eleven

The Question of the Justiciability of Social Constitutional Rights by Means of the Amparo Action 240

I. THE QUESTION OF THE JUSTICIABILITY OF SOCIAL RIGHTS 240

II. THE CASE OF THE RIGHT TO HEALTH AND THE STATE OBLIGATIONS 242

III. THE JUSTICIABILITY OF THE RIGHT TO HEALTH 247

1. The protection to the right to health as a collective right 248

2. The protection to the right to health in connection to the right to life and the social security obligations 249

3. The limited protection of the right to health and the State’s financial resources 255

4. The rejection of the amparo protection when argued in an abstract way 256

PART FOUR:

THE INJURY, THE INJURING PARTY AND THE INJURING ACTS OR OMISSIONS IN THE AMPARO PROCEEDING 259

Chapter Twelve

The General Conditions of the Injury (Harms and Threats) 261

I. THE PERSONAL AND DIRECT CHARACTER OF THE INJURY 261

II. THE ACTUAL AND REAL CHARACTER OF THE INJURY 262

III. THE MANIFESTLY ARBITRARY, ILLEGAL AND ILLEGITIMATE INJURY 267
## CONTENTS

IV. THE EVIDENT CHARACTER OF THE INJURY 268

V. THE NON-CONSENTED CHARACTER OF THE INJURY 269
   1. The express consent 270
   2. The tacit consent 270
   3. Exceptions to the tacit consent rule 272

Chapter Thirteen
The Reparable Character of the Harms and the Restorative Character of the Amparo Proceeding 276

I. THE RESTORATIVE CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO AGAINST HARMS 276

II. THE SPECIFIC CONDITION OF THE HARM: ITS REPARABLE CHARACTER 277

Chapter Fourteen
The Imminent Character of the Threats and the Preventive Character of the Amparo Proceeding 283

I. THE PREVENTIVE CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO AGAINST THREATS 283

II. THE SPECIFIC CONDITION OF THE THREAT: ITS IMMINENT CHARACTER 284

Chapter Fifteen
The Injuring Party: The Defendant (Public Entities or Private Individuals) 289

I. THE INJURING PARTY 289
   1. The question of the individuation of the defendant 290
   2. The defendant in the amparo suit: authorities and individuals 295
      A. The amparo against public authorities: public entities and public officers 296
      B. The amparo against individuals or private persons 299

II. THE PARTICIPATION OF THIRD PARTIES FOR THE DEFENDANT IN THE AMPARO PROCEEDING 303
Chapter Sixteen
The Injuring Public Actions and Omissions of Public Authorities Causing the Harms or the Threats

I. AMPARO AGAINST LEGISLATIVE ACTIONS
   1. Amparo against parliamentary bodies’ and their commissions’ decisions
   2. Amparo against laws (statutes)

II. AMPARO AGAINST EXECUTIVE AND ADMINISTRATIVE ACTS AND ACTIONS
   1. Amparo and executive acts
   2. Amparo and the political questions
   3. Amparo proceeding and the functioning of public services

III. AMPARO AGAINST JUDICIAL ACTS AND DECISIONS
   1. The admission of amparo actions against judicial decisions
   2. The exclusion of the amparo actions against judicial decisions

IV. AMPARO AGAINST ACTS OF OTHER CONSTITUTIONAL ENTITIES AND AGAINST PUBLIC OMISSIONS
   1. Acts of other constitutional entities
   2. Public entities omissions

PART FIVE:
THE EXTRAORDINARY CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO PROCEEDING

Chapter Seventeen
The Question of the Admissibility of the Amparo and Its Relation with the Ordinary Judicial Means

I. THE CONDITION OF THE NON-AVAILABILITY OF OTHER ADEQUATE JUDICIAL OR ADMINISTRATIVE MEANS FOR THE PROTECTION OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS

II. THE CONDITION OF THE PREVIOUS EXHAUSTION OF THE ORDINARY JUDICIAL MEANS

III. THE QUESTION DERIVED FROM THE PREVIOUS FILING OF OTHER REMEDIES THAT ARE PENDING DECISION, INCLUDING AMPARO SUITS
Chapter Eighteen
The Main Principles of the Procedure in the Amparo Proceeding

I. THE BILATERAL CHARACTER OF THE PROCEDURE
II. THE BRIEF AND PROMPT CHARACTER OF THE PROCESS
III. THE PREFERRED CHARACTER OF THE PROCEDURE AND THE ROLE OF THE COURTS
IV. THE ACTIVE ROLE OF THE COURTS
V. THE PREVALENCE OF SUBSTANTIVE LAW

Chapter Nineteen
The Configuration of the Main Phases of the Amparo Proceeding

I. GENERAL PROVISIONS REGARDING THE FILING OF THE PETITION
II. THE DECISION REGARDING THE ADMISSIBILITY OF THE PETITION
III. GENERAL PRINCIPLES REGARDING EVIDENCE AND BURDEN TO PROVE
IV. THE DEFENDANT'S (THE INJURER OR AGGRIEVING PARTY) PLEADING OR ANSWER
V. THE PUBLIC HEARING IN THE AMPARO SUIT

Chapter Twenty
The Adjudication in the Amparo Proceeding and the Preliminary Protective Measures

I. THE PRELIMINARY AMPARO MEASURES
II. THE SUSPENSION OF THE EFFECTS OF THE CHALLENGED ACT AND OTHER PRELIMINARY MEASURES
III. THE CONDITIONS FOR THE ISSUING OF PRELIMINARY PROTECTIVE MEASURES
IV. THE INAUDITA PARS ISSUING OF THE PRELIMINARY PROTECTIVE MEASURES
V. THE MODIFIABILITY OF THE PRELIMINARY MEASURES
Chapter Twenty-One
The Definitive Judicial Adjudication in the Amparo Suit 377
I. THE GENERAL CONDITIONS OF THE DECISION 377
II. THE PREVENTIVE AND RESTORATIVE NATURE OF THE AMPARO 380
III. THE QUESTION OF THE ANNULLING CONTENT OF THE AMPARO 382
IV. THE NON-COMPENSATORY CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO DECISION 384
V. THE PAYMENT OF THE COSTS OF THE PROCEDURE 387
VI. THE EFFECTS OF THE DEFINITIVE JUDICIAL DECISION ON THE AMPARO SUIT 387
   1. The inter partes effects and its exceptions 387
   2. The question of the scope of the res judicata effects 390
VII. THE OBLIGATORY CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO RULINGS AND THE SANCTION FOR CONTEMPT POWER 394

Chapter Twenty-Two
The Revision of the Amparo Decisions by the Constitutional Court or the Supreme Court 397
I. THE EXTRAORDINARY RE COURSE IN ARGENTINA AND THE MANDATORY JURISDICTION OF THE SUPREME COURT 400
II. THE CONSTITUTIONAL JURISDICTION REVIEW POWERS IN COUNTRIES HAVING ONLY A CONCENTRATED METHOD OF JUDICIAL REVIEW 401
   1. The exclusive power of the Constitutional Chambers of the Supreme Courts in Costa Rica and El Salvador in constitutional matters 402
   2. The Constitutional Jurisdiction Courts review powers in constitutional matters in Bolivia and Honduras 403
      A. The automatic and mandatory review jurisdiction of the Constitutional Tribunal in Bolivia 403
      B. The appellate and discretionary review jurisdiction of the Constitutional Chamber in Honduras 404
III. THE CONSTITUTIONAL JURISDICTION REVIEW
POWERS IN COUNTRIES HAVING A MIXED SYSTEM
OF JUDICIAL REVIEW  404

1. The Supreme Court of Nicaragua and its review powers
in matters judicial review through the cassation recourse 405

2. The constitutional jurisdiction review powers on
constitutional matters in Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador,
Guatemala, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela  406
   A. The automatic review jurisdiction of the
      Constitutional Tribunals in Ecuador and Colombia 406
      a. The mandatory revision in matters of
         amparo and the obligatory constitutional
         report in matters of judicial review in Ecuador 406
      b. The discretionary review jurisdiction of the
         tutela decisions in Colombia 407
   B. The appellate review jurisdiction of the
      constitutional jurisdictions in Brazil, Guatemala,
      Mexico, Peru and Venezuela  409
      a. The mandatory jurisdiction of the
         Constitutional Jurisdictions in Brazil,
         Guatemala and Peru  409
      b. The discretionary jurisdiction of the
         constitutional jurisdictions in Mexico
         and Venezuela  411

3. The ex officio review jurisdiction of the constitutional
jurisdictions in constitutional matters 413

CONCLUSION  417

APPENDIX A: List of Latin American Constitutions 423
APPENDIX B: List of Latin American Amparo Laws (Statutes) 425
INDEX  427